

The Benefits of Music Workshop Participation for Pupils' Wellbeing and Social Capital: The In2 Music Project Evaluation

Authors: Sophie Ward, Simon J. James, Kate James,
Chris Brown, Dimitra Kokotsaki and Jade Wigham



The Benefits of Music Workshop Participation for Pupils' Wellbeing and Social Capital: The In2 Music Project Evaluation

Authors: Sophie Ward^a, Simon James^b, Kate James^c, Chris Brown^a, Dimitra Kokotsaki^a and Jade Wigham^a

- a) School of Education, Durham University
- b) Department of English Studies, Durham University
- c) In2 Project Manager

Key words

Dialogic Model of Impact (DMI), music education, primary school, social capital, socio-economic deprivation, pupil wellbeing

Report created May 2020

Welcome

As chair of the Research Team for the Durham Commission on Creativity and Education, a partnership between Arts Council England and Durham University, I am delighted that Durham University and UK Research and Innovation have been able to support In2 in Darlington, and Darlington Borough Council are to be applauded for investing in the development of this model. The Commission investigated how young people are taught to be creative and to think creatively across all subjects and school levels, and looked to assess the benefits of creativity for sense of community, for skills and economic growth, and for individual identity and wellbeing. We also recognised the special place that the arts have in developing the creativity of young people. In2 is an outstanding example of how young people gain from learning to play music in schools with professional musicians. Participation in music requires both individual contribution and working as a team, both creative expression and submission to a discipline. The young people involved in In2 have clearly been enriched by the project, acquiring greater self-confidence and a sense of belonging as well as, for many, the experience of playing a musical instrument for the first time. We hope that many more young people in future will benefit from creative interventions such as In2.

Professor Simon J. James

Durham University

Contents

Executive summary	3
1. Introduction.....	5
1.1 The In2 Music Project.....	5
1.2 The research context	6
1.3 Theoretical framework	8
1.4 Research question	9
1.5 Methodology.....	9
1.6 Sampling and recruitment	10
1.7 Research ethics	11
1.8 Covid-19	11
2. Findings	11
2.1 Teacher interviews	11
2.2. Musician interviews.....	16
2.3 Observations.....	22
2.4 Conversations with parents.....	25
3. Discussion	25
3.1 Hopes/expectations for the In2 project.....	25
3.2 The In2 music project's perceived value.....	26
3.3 Behavioural changes	29
4. Conclusion	30
5. Recommendations.....	32
6. Video of project.....	33
7. References	33
8. Appendices.....	37
Appendix A: Interview questions.....	37
Appendix B: Observation schedule.....	38

Executive summary

This document reports on an evaluation of the In2 music project in Darlington, England. The project ran for seven weeks from January – March 2020. The project was funded by Darlington Borough Council and UKRI, and sits within a larger three-year study that seeks to uncover how the arts and sport help school transition for disadvantaged pupils. The In2 music project involved Year 6 pupils from four primary schools (n = 103) and Year 7 pupils from one secondary school (n = 90), working with Back Chat Brass (<http://www.backchatbrass.co.uk/>), a professional brass ensemble.

The aim of the In2 music project was to enable pupils to work with professional musicians and derive positive experiences associated with group-based music (Weinberg & Joseph, 2016). These positive experiences include ‘happiness’; ‘general life satisfaction’; ‘mood regulation’, and ‘a sense of mastery of the world’ underpinned by ‘self-esteem, optimism and perceived control’ (Weinberg & Joseph, 2016, p.2). Experiences such as ‘happiness’ and ‘optimism’ are strongly associated with social capital (Wright, 2012), which this evaluation defines as the benefits that individuals and communities derive from positive interpersonal relationships.

Darlington Borough Council helped fund the project in recognition of the high levels of socio-economic deprivation amongst the pupils in this study (see OCSI, 2020). Weinberg and Joseph’s (2016) theory on the social component of music engagement suggests that music workshops may be of particular benefit when seeking to address the emotional dimension of deprivation (Ridge, 2013).

The three-year project, of which the present study forms a discrete component, uses the Stirling Children’s Well-being Scale (EEF, 2020) to measure the impact of arts and sports interventions on pupils’ subjective wellbeing (SWB), defined as ‘quality of life’ (Diener, Oishi, & Lucas, 2003, p.405). In order to provide a comprehensive understanding of pupils’ SWB, the research team is employing triangulation to test for convergence of information from different sources (Carter et al, 2014).

This evaluation asks: **Did the In2 music project result in non-quantifiable changes that are associated with positive outcomes for pupil wellbeing, such as differences in pupils’ levels of ‘excitement and engagement’ (Brown, 2019, p.16)?**

The evaluation employs a method based on the Dialogic Model of Impact (DMI), which is designed to both assess the success of a pedagogic innovation and use this assessment as a means to improve future performance (Brown, 2019). Under DMI, success is defined through dialogue, rather than through reference to fixed criteria, such as standardised measures of pupil performance. It thereby enables teachers to play an active role in the evaluation of pedagogic innovation by

drawing upon their professional knowledge to discern non-quantifiable changes, such as differences in their pupils' levels of 'excitement and engagement' (Brown, 2019, p.16).

To facilitate discussion, interviews were conducted with the school leads/head teachers and the musicians to explore: contextual information; the driver for innovation; the learning that resulted from the project; changes to pupil behaviour (Brown, 2019). In addition, observations were undertaken in order to enable the researchers to understand the "social world" of the In2 project (Tam et al, 2012), and informal conversations were held with parents after the performances to discover their views on the value of the project.

Analysis of the resultant interview and observation data indicates that the In2 project *has* made a positive and recognisable contribution to the development of disadvantaged pupils' social capital and wellbeing. The In2 music project enabled pupils experiencing socio-economic deprivation to enjoy the benefits of fellowship through group-based music (Langston and Barrett, 2008), and to begin to develop the sense of "belonging" upon which social capital is built (Wright 2012; Diener, Oishi, & Lucas, 2003). Previously shy pupils began to contribute more in class, and anxious children overcame their fear to perform on stage. Teachers commented on how much their pupils enjoyed the project, and said that it had developed their pupils' self-confidence. One teacher described pupils as 'buzzing', and another said they were 'braver'.

In light of our findings, we make the following recommendations:

1. Scale up the project to enable more pupils to participate
2. Continue to work with Back Chat Brass
3. Invite Back Chat Brass to develop workshops that build on the insights gained through the In2 music project

1. Introduction

1.1 The In2 Music Project

The In2 music project was funded by Darlington Borough Council and UKRI through the Special Projects Fund, and sits within a larger three-year study that seeks to uncover how the arts and sport help school transition for pupils with low socio-economic status. Research suggests that, for some pupils, school transition can be stressful, and that vulnerable pupils need effective support prior to transition (Brown, 2012; Bailey, 2010; Evangelou et al, 2008; McGee et al, 2004). The music project involved Year 6 pupils from four Darlington primary schools (n = 103) and Year 7 pupils from one Darlington secondary school (n = 90), working with Back Chat Brass, a professional brass ensemble consisting of eight full band members (1 x saxophone; 2 x trombone; 2 x trumpet; 2 x drums; 1 x sousaphone) and four core band members (1 x saxophone; 1 x trumpet; 1 x drums; 1 x sousaphone). The project ran for seven weeks from January – March 2020.

Plastic instruments (pTrumpets, pTrombones, pCornets and pBuzz) were purchased with support from UKRI funding raised by Durham University and sponsorship from Warwick Music. The budget has allowed for the purchase of one instrument per child in the cohort, and these will remain in the schools as part of the legacy of the project.

Back Chat Brass ran the music workshops. The musicians encouraged free play of music and taught the pupils set pieces to be performed in front of parents, teachers, and pupils in their school. The full band worked with the pupils for the first workshop, last performance and all of the secondary school sessions. The core band worked with the pupils for the remainder of the workshops (see Table 1).

School	Year group	No. of pupils	No. of weeks	Intervention
Corporation Road Community Primary School	6	20	7	6 x two hour workshops; 1 x 45 minute workshop; 45 minute performance for rest of school and parents
Harrowgate Hill Primary School	6	20	7	6 x two hour workshops; 1 x 45 minute workshop; 45 minute performance for rest of school and parents
Firthmoor Primary School	6	40	7	6 x two hour workshops; 1 x 45 minute workshop; 45 minute performance for rest of school and parents
Northwood Primary School	6	23	3	2 x two hour workshops; 1 x 45 minute workshop; 45 minute performance for rest of school and parents
St Aidan's Church of England Academy (secondary school)	7	90	7	3 x one-off sessions with different classes

Table 1. Workshops and performances

All of the workshops and performances took place in the schools, with the exception of Firthmoor Primary School, which had workshops with the band at Darlington Hippodrome, with the final performance in school.

The aim of the In2 music project was to give pupils the opportunity to work with professional musicians and thereby to:

- foster pupils' ambition and aspiration by performing with people who earn a living making music
- show pupils options for the future, outside the more formal and narrow curriculum
- build pupils' confidence through performing in front of others
- increase pupils' memory skills as they learn the notes and songs
- improve pupils' coordination and listening skills as they work with the band to learn the songs and choreography
- learn perseverance – it takes time to master the instrument
- learn responsibility – their bandmates will be let down if they don't practise, pay attention, turn up etc.

1.2 The research context

The project took place against a backdrop of increasing cross-party concern about the crisis facing music education in England in the wake of curriculum reform. A recent report found that:

Government policy, particularly around accountability measures like the English Baccalaureate (EBacc), has significantly negatively impacted on music education in schools in England. Curriculum time for music (which is statutory for Key Stage 1–3) has reduced, along with opportunities for children to pursue music to GCSE and A Level. (University of Sussex, 2019, p.3)

The project also took place against a backdrop of school funding cuts, which have further contributed to the loss of music provision in schools (Fautley & Murphy, 2016). After years of Government cuts, 31 of 36 schools in Darlington are still in crisis, with a predicted financial shortfall of £4m in 2020, equating to a per-pupils loss of £291 (Stop School Cuts, 2020). In response to the University of Sussex's (2019) report on the lack of music in schools, the Government announced plans for a new model music curriculum for children age 5 to 14, to be published in summer 2020 (TES, 2020). It also pledged £1.33 million to fund 120 music hubs to co-ordinate music provision between schools, teachers and music organisations in their area (ibid). Although welcome, this news does not alter the policy landscape for the teachers, pupils and musicians involved with the In2 music project.

School funding cuts are part of the UK Government's deficit reduction plan, unveiled in 2010 (see HM Treasury, 2010). The Government's policy of austerity has resulted in a sharp decline in spending on welfare, with negative consequences for families with low socio-economic status. In March 2020, Darlington Borough Council published its Local Insight profile for the Darlington Area (OCSI, 2020). According to this report, 25% of people have no qualifications in Darlington, compared with 22% across England; 20% of people in Darlington have a limiting long-term illness,

compared with 18% across England, and 20% of children are living in poverty in Darlington, compared with 17% across England. Darlington Borough Council's Local Insight profile for the Darlington Area (OCSI, 2020) records % of children (aged 0-15) in poverty (as % all children aged 0-15). According to this data, Firthmoor Primary and Northwood Primary are located in areas with **15.9% - 24.7%** of children (aged 0-15) in poverty, while Harrowgate Hill Primary, Corporation Road Primary and St. Aidan's Academy are located in areas with **24.7% - 92.9%** of children (aged 0-15) in poverty.

The impact of austerity on the people of Darlington has been explored by the Community Foundation (2017, p.5), who report that severe and multiple disadvantage (SMD) occurs when 'someone faces multiple, often related and mutually reinforcing, issues which create a high degree of exclusion from society and lead to high levels of stigma'. Four issues commonly found together are 'offending, substance misuse, homelessness and mental health problems' (ibid). Darlington is among the areas of Tees Valley with the highest rates of SMD (150 to 307 people with 2+ aspects of SMD) (ibid).

Some of the pupils taking part in the In2 music project are experiencing SMD, such as homelessness, reliance on food banks, and family breakdown. Tess Ridge (2013, p.410) offers a child-centred perspective on austerity, arguing that Government policy has stigmatised disadvantaged children by inflaming 'myths and stereotypes associated with notions of the "underclass" and the "deserving" and "undeserving" poor'. Children, argues Ridge (2013, p.411), 'do not exist in a vacuum'; they are 'seasoned media watchers and active and aware social participants'. Disadvantaged children are thus at risk of internalising the message that their parents are "scroungers", "skivers", "work shy" and "feckless" (ibid, pp. 410-411). In addition to experiencing social humiliation, disadvantaged children experience anxiety over their family finances, and are obliged to withdraw from social activities that require money. As noted by Ridge:

Childhood is increasingly commodified and opportunities to take part in clubs, sports and other leisure activities are dictated by cost and other access factors such as the availability of transport to travel to out of town facilities, and the accessibility of after-school clubs and leisure centres. Clearly cuts in social security benefits have a severe financial impact in disadvantaged families but one part of that impact for children will be that there is less money to go round and restricted family budgets will mean reductions in children's participation. (Ridge, 2013, p.409)

The In2 music project therefore offers a much-needed corrective to this social injustice by bringing professional musicians into schools to work with disadvantaged children who (i) do not have the means to take part in musical activities outside of school (Ridge, 2013), and (ii) are experiencing government-imposed limitations on within-school music provision (University of Sussex, 2019).

Weinberg and Joseph's (2016) theory on the social component of music engagement suggests that music workshops may be of particular benefit when seeking to address the emotional dimension of deprivation identified by Ridge (2013). According to Weinberg and Joseph (2016), the social component of music engagement is a key factor contributing to the positive outcomes for wellbeing

associated with music. They argue that, while research has indicated that engaging with music alone may improve physical health and emotional wellbeing, 'other research has shown that engaging with music in the company of others is associated with stronger positive experiences' (ibid, p.3). These positive experiences include, but are not limited to, 'happiness'; 'general life satisfaction'; 'mood regulation', and 'a sense of mastery of the world' underpinned by 'self-esteem, optimism and perceived control' (ibid, p.2). Music workshops that increase pupils' positive experiences offer hope that we might counterbalance or eradicate disadvantaged children's internalisation of the negative messages about poverty propagated by Government, which locate poverty as a personal failure (Ridge, 2013).

1.3 Theoretical framework

In her review of music education research, Anita Prest (2016, p.127) reports that an increasing number of researchers are using social capital theory as a framework to explore the 'personal and collective benefits' of music education. Despite its obvious utility for the exploration of the relationship between music education and wellbeing, social capital theory risks importing ambiguity into music education research unless carefully defined, as the term 'social capital' is employed quite differently by its most notable exponents, John Dewey and Pierre Bourdieu. According to Dewey (1909), social capital is inclusive and benefits society, while Bourdieu (1986) argues that social capital is exclusive and benefits the individual. In educational research, social capital is often defined as the network of relations that support pupils' attainment of credentials for employment (Gerwitz et al, 2015), and thus is closely aligned with the "winner takes all" discourse critiqued by Bourdieu (1986). This present study draws, instead, upon Dewey's (1909, p.72) understanding of social capital, endorsing his belief that 'it is the business of society as a whole today, to see to it that the environment is provided which will utilize all of the individual capital that is being born into it.' We therefore define social capital as **the benefits that the individual and community derive from positive interpersonal relationships that enable every individual to thrive.**

The three-year project, of which the present study forms a discrete component, uses the Stirling Children's Well-being Scale (EEF, 2020; see <https://www.annafreud.org/media/4612/mwb-toolki-final-draft-4.pdf>) to measure the impact of arts and sports interventions on pupils' subjective wellbeing (SWB), defined as 'people's emotional and cognitive evaluations of their lives' (Diener, Oishi, & Lucas, 2003 p.403). In order to provide a comprehensive understanding of pupils' SWB, the research team is employing triangulation to test for convergence of information from different sources (Carter et al, 2014). This evaluation therefore employs a constructivist approach, arguing after Tam, Lau and Jiang (2012, p.24) that 'Individuals differ in the extent to which they internalize cultural ideas' and that people's subjective wellbeing and social capital are 'dynamically constructed'. Adopting this approach, we acknowledge that pupils' understanding of the world is constructed through social interactions that take place within multiple cultures (school; family; local community; social media, etc.) and result in variations in pupils'

subjective wellbeing and social capital that are difficult to explain using conventional measures of SWB (Rees & Bradshaw, 2018).

1.4 Research question

In light of the above, this evaluation asks:

Did the In2 music project result in non-quantifiable changes that are associated with positive outcomes for pupil wellbeing and social capital, such as differences in pupils' levels of 'excitement and engagement' (Brown, 2019, p.16)?

1.5 Methodology

This evaluation employs a method based on the Dialogic Model of Impact (DMI), which is designed to both assess the success of a pedagogic innovation and use this assessment as a means to improve future performance (Brown, 2019). Under DMI, success is defined through dialogue, rather than through reference to fixed criteria, such as standardised measures of pupil performance. It thereby enables teachers to play an active role in the evaluation of pedagogic innovation by drawing upon their professional knowledge to discern non-quantifiable changes, such as differences in their pupils' levels of 'excitement and engagement' (Brown, 2019, p.16). It also enables people delivering the project to play a vital role in the evaluation through discussion of what they believe went well and what they would do differently in the future.

DMI was selected as a model for the current evaluation due to the proximity of its approach to the long-established framework for the assessment of arts education by Arts Council England (ACE, 2006). Like DMI, ACE (2006) advocates dialogue between artists delivering the pedagogic innovation and teachers, whom it describes as 'partners' (ibid, p.10). However, DMI goes beyond ACE (2006) by providing a method to collect contextual data. These data enable successful projects to be replicated elsewhere and/or scaled-up, not by recreating the exact conditions but by understanding how we might 'copy interventions in *essence*' (Brown, 2019, p.20, italics in original). Evaluations based on DMI therefore have the potential to support the on-going development and dissemination of successful pedagogic innovations; something this current project is keen to support as part of a wider study of the impact of arts education on school transition.

DMI is described in detail by Chris Brown (2019), but in summary evaluations based on this method consider:

1. The *context* in which the school or setting is situated
2. The *problem or driver* for innovation
3. Detail on *the innovation* and how it was intended to result in change
4. *Activities and interactions* related to the introduction and roll-out of the approach
5. *Learning* that results from engaging in these activities/results from interactions
6. *Changes in behaviour* (and the extent to which something is being used):
7. What *difference* have behavioural changes made?
8. *Reframing value* reassessing what is possible in relation to the innovation.

In this study, questions about contextual information were put to the teachers. Questions about the driver for innovation; how it was intended to result in change, and the project activities were put to the musicians. Questions about learning that results from engaging in these activities were put to the musicians and teachers. Questions about changes to behaviour and the difference these changes have made were put to the teachers. Questions about reframing value and assessing what is possible in relation to the innovation were put to the musicians and teachers (see Appendix A). In addition, questions about the value of the project were put to parents during informal conversations after the performances at two of the schools.

Observations of workshops and performances were undertaken in order to enable the researchers to gain some understanding of the “social world” of the In2 music project (Tam et al, 2012). The aim of qualitative observation is to draw the researcher ‘into the phenomenological complexity of the participants’ worlds’ (Cohen, Manion & Morrison, 2018 p.314) and witness ‘how situations unfold’ (ibid). Unstructured observation was therefore selected as our method, in order to generate a hypothesis about the In2 music project (ibid). Observations carry the risk of bias: for example, people may differ in how they interpret a non-verbal gesture (ibid). To minimise bias, the observer was briefed in advance about the aim of the evaluation; the purpose of the observation as part of this evaluation, and what she was observing (Cohen, Manion & Morrison, 2018). When using observational methods, decisions need to be made about how often to measure (e.g. continuous or momentary time sampling), over what period of time (one session or the duration of the project), and what unit (e.g. everyone in the room or just the pupils) (Fredricks et al, 2019). In this study, the observer undertook continuous observations of a sample of workshops from each school. In total, observations were made of seven workshops, four rehearsals and four performances (NB, Firthmoor split pupils into two groups for the workshops). The observer was given freedom to determine the unit, with the chosen unit(s) recorded on the observation sheet (see Appendix B). Notes were written-up as soon as possible after the observation. The observations were analysed using a qualitative method based on Miles and Huberman (1984), in which the notes were summarised; data coded; metaphors used to convey a sense of what was witnessed; salient themes identified, and vignettes created.

1.6 Sampling and recruitment

The schools were selected with the support of the Council’s Strategy and Performance Team. They identified the most deprived wards in Darlington and looked at which primary schools fed into which secondary schools in each of these – the aim was to find the primary schools with historically the largest percentage of pupils moving on to the selected secondary schools. There were six primary schools on the longlist: one did not respond and one did not want to participate unless all of the pupils in the entire school could be involved.

The schools were asked to identify the pupils to participate, as the pilot demonstrated that the teachers had good knowledge of individual needs. The selection criteria was pupils who did not reach formal thresholds for additional/formal

support, but who they knew had social, economic, behavioural or health and wellbeing challenges which could make them vulnerable during the transition from primary to secondary school.

Back Chat Brass were chosen as they had considerable experience delivering similar projects and had the necessary kit (plastic instruments). They had also delivered a one-off session in two schools during the pilot.

1.7 Research ethics

This research project complies with BERA's (2018) *Ethical Guidelines for Educational Research, Fourth Edition*. It received ethical approval on 12/02/20 from the Director of Research Ethics, Department of English Studies, Durham University. Please note: schools gave permission for their names to be used in this evaluation.

1.8 Covid-19

Data collection was disrupted by the Covid-19 pandemic. From 16th March 2020, Durham University suspended face-to-face data collection. Consequently, the observations in St. Aidan's were cancelled and the interview was conducted via email. The subsequent closure of UK schools meant that it was not possible to contact Northwood, so there is observation data for this school but no interview data.

If the COVID-19 restrictions had not come into play, the children would have performed with Back Chat Brass at one or more public festivals.

2. Findings

2.1 Teacher interviews

1. Challenges faced by school and pupils

Consistent with the report by Darlington Borough Council (OCSI, 2020), teachers said that a high proportion of their pupils were disadvantaged. They expressed concern over their pupils' material and emotional wellbeing, and implied that there is a connection between deprivation and self-belief. For example:

'Basically, we are in a catchment area where it's socially deprived. So our children have quite tough lives. They have a hard life. You know, they have a lot of hard circumstances within home, whether it's poverty or, you know, lack of resources or parent interaction.' (Corporation Road)

'A lot of our children struggle with the self-confidence and the self-esteem...they're so shy.' (Firthmoor)

'Students have low aspirations for their future...We welcome organisations into the Academy, especially those who can offer our students an experience outside of the classroom.' (St Aidan's)

2. Hopes for the project

Teachers hoped the project would enhance pupils' self-confidence and expand their horizons. For example:

'What we were really looking for - and the music part in particular - was for them just to be a bit braver to try something that they wouldn't normally do and just to develop that little bit of resilience that you're performing in front of people - it is difficult at the best of times. So really, really stepping out of their comfort zone giving them that sort of sense that they could do that.' (Harrowgate Hill)

'Well, to develop the self-confidence and self-esteem of every child. Some of them really, really do struggle, so I would hope that every child could participate in every [workshop] and build up to the performance. So that so that they could then feel a sense of, you know, that they're successful?' (Firthmoor)

'We hoped that some students would enjoy the workshop so much that it would encourage them to either attend an extracurricular music club at school or find a club in the community that they could attend.' (St Aidan's)

One teacher hoped that engagement with music might also offer pupils ongoing respite from adversity:

'It's also like a little bit of escapism, so if things are tough, you can take yourself somewhere else and make yourself feel good and positive about everything.' (Corporation Road)

3. Benefits of the project for pupils

All of the teachers said their pupils had grown in confidence and that the project had fostered positive feelings:

'I think that they've been really into it - they've been so interested and they've been so enthusiastic and they've been just like the other day when they did the performance, they were actually buzzing weren't they? It was just so lovely. And they've gained confidence. I mean for them to stand there and perform like they did. Some of those children are really shy. And it just didn't come across at all did it? They were just yeah, it was lovely, really confident and they've opened up and I think they've become more positive and they've got more self-belief and confidence in themselves. Yeah, it was lovely.' (Corporation Road)

'I think they've gained a lot of self-confidence. We still we did have a few issues, and on the seventh week in the performance, there was still a couple who lacked confidence, and there was a couple that perhaps nearly didn't sort of join in because of that. But at the last minute, you know, they did overcome that, and I think they felt successful, because a lot of them don't

feel like they are successful in a lot of things in school, but it was a chance for them to be successful. And they felt it.' (Firthmoor)

'They are they are starting to get braver, they are starting to be a little bit more resilient. With the music, in particular, there were one or two boys who got a little bit cagey about joining in, they had their days when they were happy to join in and they had days when they didn't want to, and they wanted to give up. But they didn't give up in the end. And I think that was, that was really important.' (Harrowgate Hill)

'Pupils developed their confidence in both practicing and performing. A small number of students have taken part in music performances in our school worship (assembly), through attending our music sessions afterschool with staff. Pupils enjoyed working with musicians and the feedback from students was extremely positive.' (St Aidan's)

4. Changes to pupils' behaviour

Three out of four schools said that their pupils' behaviour had improved:

'Within class, children that wouldn't share their ideas before because they might make a mistake, or they would sit quiet and let everybody else do it because they're the children that get the right answers - I feel like that they're more, "I'll give it a go. I'll try, you know, and if I make a mistake, it doesn't matter". You know, it's not the end of the world, and it doesn't matter, because that's how we learn, isn't it? And they have a goal mentality. Really, really good. Yeah. So I think as well, it's made them feel good about their learning. And you know, when we're saying about the transferable skills, so you know, where they felt like they're doing well in that creative side, they're more likely to have a go at things that are a little bit tough.' (Corporation Road)

'They've been more responsive and more positive in their behaviour towards, you know, being taught by the band members. And so yeah, I've seen a slight improvement in some of the pupils' behaviours who are perhaps sometimes quite negative, have then been quite positive.' (Firthmoor)

'There's a couple of boys in there that can be a little bit...their behaviour can be a little bit up and down. And there have been times when, "Well, if you don't comply, then you won't be able to go and stay as part of the In2 project". And "Actually, if you want to do that, then you need to do this". So it's been sort of that carrot and stick but it's been that reward that they've needed. Because sometimes for those children, the rewards that we have in school aren't high value enough. So it's been a very high value reward for them to work for. So they've been pleased to do that.' (Harrowgate Hill)

5. Teachers' support for the project

Teachers said they met with In2 to organise the project, moved timetables around to make space for the workshops, and organised performances for parents to attend. They also described how much they wanted the project to be a success. For example:

'Well, I think, obviously, by making sure that all the children have had the same opportunity. So it's, you know, making sure that all the children have actually got to the point where they can perform and, and making it high profile with the parents. So we've kept the parents up to date and we've put little clips and images on the website, so people can see how well the project's going. And so we've kept it high profile and around like outside of school as well as in the classroom, just so that everybody's there, everybody's involved in what the children are doing.' (Firthmoor)

'It was the head teacher that brought it to my attention. She's, you know, very, very keen for us to join these sort of wider structures outside of our school because in school you can become very insular. It's about sort of opening those doors just like we tried to open the children's minds a bit. It's about opening our school doors to other things as well, and bringing in a breath of fresh air.' (Harrowgate Hill)

6. What teachers learned from the project

Teachers said the project made them aware of the importance of working with external people and having music in school. For example:

'We can do, obviously, teaching in school, and we do as much as we can, but having those professionals - having people who do it for a living - to come in and work with the children so children can actually see it, how it is in real life, and see people doing it as a profession. And I think I've learned that it's invaluable having children working with outside agencies and working with other people and to learn new skills and develop their self-confidence and self-belief and actually see what the future holds, what they can actually aspire to do or to learn an instrument, you know, to, to become a musician.' (Firthmoor)

'I think, as a school, we've realised that a little bit of formal music training actually can have massive impact all round. And, and it's worth it. It's so worthwhile because the pleasure that the children had. The pleasure that the whole school had when they performed for us, and that can sort of carry on now and go forward. Because we would get the instruments donated. We have a choir at school anyway, and our music teacher's really keen to carry on with that as well.' (Harrowgate Hill)

'Staff commented that it has shown them how fun it can be to play brass instruments.' (St Aidan's)

7. The value of the project

The teachers praised the expertise of Back Chat Brass and noted that, normally, they are not able to provide music education of this calibre:

'You don't know a lot of primary teachers who are musicians or even musical. Even teachers who lead music in the school don't all play an instrument. So yeah, having professionals to actually teach the children was just fabulous... If the school had bought in the instrument themselves, with the teachers not being experts or knowing how to play the instruments (link it to a song, read notes, that kind of thing) there's no way the children would have learned to play the instruments at the level they have.' (Firthmoor)

Consistent with the University of Sussex's (2019) report, teachers said their schools lack the resources to provide music education, making the In2 music project extremely valuable to them:

'I mean, not being awful, but the funding aspect of it and the fact that we've been able to access these resources and these little trips out and these experiences, it's brilliant, because every school's struggling for budget, aren't they?' (Corporation Road)

'We used to have a professional musician who came in and we had a rock band, and unfortunately we lost at the end of last year that, that stopped because we didn't have that funding anymore. So we were worried we would lose our music. We were a very musical school, certainly last year, and [the In2 project] helped to sort of revamp it a little bit and give to those children again. Just remind them how wonderful it can be, that sort of performing thing. We do lots of performing anyway. We have house competitions every year where we have talent competitions and all of those sorts of things. But it was really nice to bring it to a sort of a purely musical level rather than just get up there and sing to a tape through YouTube.' (Harrowgate Hill)

Teachers found the project valuable because it enabled deprived pupils and their parents to experience something beyond their normal expectations, and fostered a sense of pride. For example:

'I think this project is valuable as many of our students are from disadvantaged backgrounds, and might not get the opportunity to work with brass instruments.' (St Aidan's)

'Working with the Back Chat Brass band was just phenomenal...Not many children get a chance to actually work with people like that. I think the opportunity that has come for our children has just been phenomenal.' (Firthmoor)

'Did you see the parents at the back [of school hall during the performance]? They were so excited about it and they were beaming. You just think that's lovely that the parents feel proud and in return, the children feel proud

because they're making the parents smile. And it's just that big cycle, isn't it? Everybody's proud and then they feel good...It's not just something that you're doing at school – the family can get involved as well.' (Corporation Road)

8. Recommendations for future projects

Teachers said they would like the project to remain the same, but be available to more children:

'I would definitely keep the music element of the project. If we could have all of the cohort it would be great, because having seen it, I think every child will get something out of it. So yes, great, really good. It's been really lovely and Back Chat Brass - their manner with the children and everything - is just perfect. You know, they've got the boundary but they've got the fun element as well, in the fact that it's okay to be a little bit silly. But yeah, really lovely role models for the children.' (Corporation Road)

'No, I think it was very, very successful. It is just unfortunate it could only be with 20 children, I'd love to do it with the whole, you know, with all the children. How amazing would that be? But with the school as big as ours, it is quite difficult to get around to everybody, and to have that sort of equality of opportunity. But then again, you could argue that the children we chose were particular because they don't have that opportunity. Then again, I could have easily put in 20 different children and got as much out of it. It has just been amazing.' (Harrowgate Hill)

'I would really like the opportunity for more students to be involved, and we would love to have the opportunity to put together a performance that could be shown in our whole school worship...We are extremely grateful to have been given the chance to work with Back Chat Brass – students and staff love the workshops and we look forward to working with you again.' (St Aidan's)

'I don't think I would do anything differently. I think having the professionals in to show the children and teach the children has been invaluable and I would recommend to just continue to do that.' (Firthmoor)

One school said the project was time consuming, but did not recommend making changes:

'I mean, it's probably a little bit more time consuming for us as a school than I had expected...I wasn't expecting it to be quite such a load a workload on me as it has been, but I'm quite happy to do it because I think it's worthwhile.' (Harrowgate Hill)

2.2. Musician interviews

1. Project aims

Back Chat Brass identified three aims for their project: (i) to provide disadvantaged children with the opportunity to play music, (ii) address the lack of music provision in schools, and (iii) develop pupils' self-confidence and love of music:

(i) Providing music for disadvantaged pupils

'So we want to give the kids an opportunity to play instruments that they probably wouldn't get. Quite often in this area, and some of the schools that we go into, might be slightly lower income areas... One of the biggest barriers to entry for children is the cost of the instrument themselves, because parents can't afford to buy the instruments to have a go. So if they get to have a try, they know they're keen to do it. Then hopefully after this project, they might decide they want to continue, and they'll have a bit of ground me to go to the parents and ask, "Can you pay for some lessons? Can you actually do this? Make this work?"' (BCB A)

(ii) Addressing lack of music provision in schools

'And as music has been taken away from the general curriculum, it very quickly becomes something that can only really be accessed by people higher up, you know, with more money really.' (BCB A)

'A lot of the time schools were pushing drums or something like that, that they have been doing for years, and they'll often have a cupboard of some really old instruments...Brass instruments themselves are quite expensive - to actually get 30 brass instruments.' (BCB B)

'I think in recent years the one thing that has seemed to get pushed in schools is this thing called wider opportunity. Yeah, it's full class music. And the idea is this is planning for the teachers and bringing a musician in to come and teach a full class, often ukuleles. I've heard full class violins before. Which to me also there must be a cheaper version of those. Even the cheapest [musical instruments] are not as cheap as the plastic ones.' (BCB A)

(iii) Developing pupils' self-confidence and love of music

'Aside from the instruments themselves and getting playing, it's the performance aspect - it also helps a lot with growing confidence.' (BCB A)

'Getting them to perform in a group can help grow confidence. You do have those times where there those quieter people, who are low in confidence, might realise they're actually quite good at this. And it gives them that extra little boost, which translates across, not just in music, just across the day-to-day as well.' (BCB B)

'Hopefully they'll come away thinking, "Actually, music is great and I want to do more of that, playing together."' (BCB B)

2. How they delivered the workshops

Back Chat Brass described how they (i) developed their method for using plastic instruments in workshops, (ii) their approach to teaching and (iii) their song choice:

(i) Development of plastic instrument workshops

'The brass festival was the first place we did plastic brass instruments, and the first few were quite ropey - trying to find a fit in terms of how we formed the workshops and everything... I genuinely hadn't picked up a trombone in my life until then - I played a trumpet before, so I did kind of have an idea. But the trombone, I'd never done. So I kind of thought because it was just the four of us [in Back Chat Brass], and none of us played trombone, I kind of thought, "I've got to learn a little bit". So that's good fun. But what we find is that you need to have lots of times in the sessions where you just play and just let [the workshop participants] go around the section maybe more times than you would do.' (BCB A)

(ii) Approach to teaching

'They've got an instrument in their hands that they want to play, you know, they don't want to stand there ready to play while you talk at them for 45 minutes... And especially to start with, they're going to probably figure things out for themselves as well. In terms of, you know, they managed to get some note when the mouthpiece was slightly higher on the lip, slightly lower on the lip, so they figure that out. There's only so much we can see.' (BCB B)

'We have [asked a specific pupil to play a note] if we see that someone's doing really well. Which is sometimes a bit of a risk because if you're like, "Oh that sounds so good, can you show the group?" and they suddenly can't. But sometimes we've used that as a technique when there might be people who have been misbehaving in previous weeks and suddenly they're trying.' (BCB A)

'We will go down the line [of pupils] and make sure certain notes are coming out, because it can be a case of the slightly quieter children who are struggling to get the notes out. If they're also low in confidence as well, they'll just go hide in the noise...So it's less daunting for them when you've got all that noise happening to have someone help them out rather than being singled out in front of everyone.' (BCB B)

'The way we will often work is we will play alongside, whether children or adults, because we want it to sound good...One of the things I notice is kids who seem a bit disinterested, they suddenly realise "This does actually sound quite good", and I think that's why it's important. If we were just trying to make it so that [Back Chat Brass] are not involved - I've personally found that doesn't work as well as saying, "You're going to join us - you're going

to join the professionals and we're going to do a performance together.”
(BCB A)

(iii) Song choice

'[Song choice] comes down to what key the song is, which is a bit of a boring answer! So that's the first thing, because in terms of what notes are played, it's whether you can get you notes. The tunes that we picked all have the same repeated chord sequence...“Shotgun” was dead easy for the children because they all know it...the rhythm fits with the word so I've done that song loads of times, like in special needs groups.' (BCB A)

'Each song produces a different element. So the first one ['Shotgun' by George Ezra] was a perfect introduction to get them playing the notes, get them using their tongue to separate notes. The second one ['Someone You Loved' by Lewis Capaldi] introduces harmony. So it's different levels of complexity. The third one ['Lean on Me' by Bill Withers], is a call and response with the different rhythms as well. So each one's sort of clear development.' (BCB B)

3. Managing pupil behaviour

Back Chat Brass described strategies to deal with challenging behaviour, and the importance of not being biased:

'The school we were in this morning are probably the easiest group in terms of behaviour, so we'll kind of let more slide whereas in some of the other schools they are a bit trickier. We are very much left to our own devices in terms of the discipline. That can be quite tricky. At the school this morning everyone seemed up for it, everyone's invested, whereas in some of the schools, some of the children like to disrupt. That's where it's a bit of a challenge. So you've got to find a way. I've found the best way to deal with it is when you see, as soon as they get involved at any point, you kind of draw attention to them. So the session this afternoon, there's been this one particular lad who has always been quite difficult but when we did the drumming workshop he just totally took to it. So I complimented him and you could tell the change and you know he's trying to hide his smile. (BCB A)

'Sometimes you will get told the stuff [about pupils with behavioural issues]. When we first go to a group, I like to not know anything, because you start treating them different. I've worked in EBD schools where all the children are those kind of misbehaving pupils, and there was a school we'd been working at for weeks and there was this pupil and we said to a teacher, “Why is he here? He's so well behaved” and he said we should see him in any of the lessons - he's the worst. It was just the drums was what his thing. I prefer to not know unless it's something specific like a medical thing - people allergic

to plastic - stupid example, but in terms of what they are usually like, I prefer not to know. We will learn and we will learn what they are usually like in our session.' (BCB A)

4. Improvements to pupil behaviour

Back Chat Brass reported that pupils' levels of cooperation varied from week to week according to their mood, but as familiarity with the musicians increased over time, the children's behaviour changed. When they started to feel like the music was sounding good, their engagement with the activities and group work increased:

'And so there has been some shifts in behaviour. It can change week to week, it depends what's happening for the rest of the day...You know that we have two girls at school yesterday, the week before. They were both not in a great place.' (BCB A) *'They refused to play - you could tell she was, she was playing trumpet. She was watching the other children. She was putting down the right valves but had no interest in actually playing the trumpet. She left the room a couple times as well. But then this week, she's happy. Really keen, really involved, answered questions.'* (BCB B)

'Everyone, you know, in a class aren't always going to get along. Yeah, but they're all coming together to do something together, and they're all aiming for a thing. This time, similar goals... The less focussed ones definitely become more focused - knowing there's a performance coming, knowing that everyone's gonna be watching. If it doesn't go well, people are gonna notice, so you can see them, especially in the weeks that we started saying, "This is the rehearsal, we've got one more rehearsal until the performance" thinking, this is a real thing: now this isn't just time off maths to play trombone. Yeah, you can see them focusing more.' (BCB B)

'You can see them take ownership of it and the maybe slightly disinterested ones suddenly starting to nudge the one next to them that keeps trying to distract them and try to get them involved again. You do see that switch you had.' (BCB B)

5. Support from the schools

Back Chat Brass said they had felt supported by four of the five schools. They compared levels of support and school ethos:

'Some schools will be better with the discipline aspects. They will step in some, and we can take a step back.' (BCB B)

'In the [one school] where the sessions are supposed to be, all the classrooms around the edge were able to look in, so instantly we were just like, "Is there somewhere else we can go?" We just knew that it would be

better, even if it's cramped in a classroom but it's just shut off [so the school provided a different room].' (BCB A)

'[In another school] there was a giant fan on for weeks...that means you're instantly competing to be heard, which is just causing more stress: the general noise level then just increases.' (BCB A). *'People told us [the fans] can't be turned off because the cookers won't work, and then one week basically all it took was one different member staff to go, "Oh yeah I'll turn that off" and we've been asking for weeks.'* (BCB B)

'Sometimes you just find there's a certain feeling at a school. For instance, [at one school] there's loads of safeguarding things. I don't like to be told, as somebody who's DBS checked, "He has to be walked to and from the toilet by a member of staff, because of safeguarding reasons." I find that a bit patronising, and that's what that school is like. We have to be paraded, we have to be escorted as if we're criminals. And so that's the thing in that school. A lot of schools can be a lot more strict and often we've been told it can be a result of something that has happened.' (BCB A)

6. What Back Chat Brass learned from the project

Back Chat Brass reported that it was different going into schools for an extended period, rather than for one-off sessions, and that they should have higher expectations of the children.

'[We've learned] how to deal with each particular schools and some of their systems. It definitely brings that out a lot more. If we go in and do a one-off at a certain school, you don't really think about it. You just go, "Oh, that was a bit of a pain to sign in and get through the door" and when you're doing it every week, you start to realise that can be quite difficult to work with.' (BCB A)

'I guess I have learned to expect pupils can do way more - expect them to do anything and be proved wrong rather than expect them not to be able to do anything... I think we've pushed it a bit more this time in terms of harmony. We've never done that. Yeah...they do retain a lot of information.' (BCB A)

'Yes. It's been great coming back the next week, having introduced something like harmony, which most of these children have never heard of before, and they remember what it is. Yeah, that's something we didn't necessarily expect.' (BCB B)

'Having a longer time-periods to work with each group, being able to take that time, which we don't often get a chance to do. Now, quite often we're in for one, maybe two sessions. So having that longer period to be able to work through these different concepts over time. They do seem to retain a lot more.' (BCB B)

7. What they would do differently in a future project

Black Chat Brass would focus on having fun, not technical things. They would get the children playing more, perhaps using a variety of instruments:

'I prefer sessions that kind of get onto the fun stuff quicker. I think sometimes, we will spend too much time on the technical stuff. I personally think, and this is me - I've had a chat to the guys about this - I find children to learn way better when they're doing it and not worrying too much about the technical side of stuff. Because I'm obviously learning as well, and I know that I will learn by just having a go. And having the context of the pieces and doing the pieces, working towards this [performance] at the end of this session, we're going to do all this technical stuff and in the end will be a much better place. I don't like that. I would push that if we did it again, we'd be getting onto tunes faster, doing them for longer adding different elements within the tunes.' (BCB A)

'There's potential for drums' (BCB 2). 'We did drums last week, just a session. Drums are an easy one cos anyone can do it.' (BCB A)

'You could mix in different instruments, but I think that would be on a longer term project. I think the fact it is "just brass" is the best way, so I think this has been really good.' (BCB B)

2.3 Observations

1. Harrowgate Hill (one workshop, rehearsal and performance)

There is a feeling of uncertainty as the children enter the room. One boy immediately sits in the corner. About ten minutes later, he climbs under a table but begins to get involved when invited to change musical instrument. Some of the children seem nervous and hesitate when asked to use the plastic trombones and trumpets. Gradually the shyer children begin to play the instruments, but do not take part in the singing and dancing. One boy looks particularly anxious – he is paying attention to the musicians, but is very reserved. Most of the children are smiling and eager to play the instruments. One girl can remember all of the musical notes from the previous week. When the musicians ask volunteers to do a solo, many children put their hands up, and some hop up and down with excitement. The children enjoy the dancing: they are smiling as they copy the lead dancer's moves. They sing loudly and make a lot of eye contact with the musicians and each other. The musicians pay close attention to the pupils: they make an effort to motivate a girl who would not sit in the circle with the other pupils at the start of the session, and gradually she begins to join in. They use subtle cues to help the children remember what they learned in the previous workshop. They direct praise towards certain children, often praising the performance of a distracted child the moment he or she is back on track. They are constructive in their feedback, asking the pupils to identify what might have gone wrong (e.g. not playing the right note). The pupils respond well to praise, and seek approval from the musicians. During the performance, there is a marked difference: one boy who was very shy during the workshops is fully engaged and smiling.

2. Northwood (rehearsal and performance)

The children seem excited and eager to start playing the instruments, and they tell off friends who are talking or not paying attention. The musicians give advice on the correct way to hold the instruments and remind them of technical terms. The children play close attention and look both serious and animated. When the musicians give the pupils an important instruction not to turn around to look at the band during the performance, the pupils nod and appear to take in this information. Some children seem agitated, and two children leave the group but quickly return when the musicians speak to them. Some children are slightly reserved during the rehearsal and do not dance or move their bodies in time with the music like the other children. At the performance, some of the children are nervous, but concentration levels are higher than during the rehearsal and their singing is much livelier. The pupils are able to correct mistakes identified in the rehearsal and are smiling during and after their performance.

3. Firthmoor (four workshops, rehearsal and performance)

At the first workshop observed, the children do not seem confident about doing the dancing parts. A group of boys talk amongst themselves, and nobody is keen to volunteer for solo parts. When nobody volunteers to dance, one of the musicians begins dancing and encourages the children to copy him. The children begin to dance. The musicians demonstrate what they want the children to play, and go round the children individually to identify any who are struggling. One girl remembers the definition of “harmony”. A pupil is keen to show the others how to hold the instrument. There is some sense of chaos: children are complaining that their lips hurt; some of them will not stand in the circle; other pupils cajole them into taking part and encourage them to stop talking. It is not easy for the musicians to get some of the children to be quiet and start playing, but they seem to know how to handle the disruptive pupils and most of the children cooperate. The musicians are constructive in their feedback. When the music goes wrong, the musicians ask the children what they think happened. When children shout out their answers, the musicians ignore them, and say they must put their hand up if they want to answer a question. Some of the children look bored and restless – they require a lot of encouragement from the musicians to stay focused. By the end, four of the pupils are no longer participating in the workshop, and are sitting or standing outside the circle instead.

At the second workshop observed, one pupil is very enthusiastic – he offers to lead the dancing and sings loudly. This time, the pupils seem engaged from the outset – they listen to the instructions and stop playing their instruments when told to do so. They do not talk or waste time in between songs, and are keen to answer questions about technical terms. Children volunteer for solos and appear more confident. One boy is disengaged towards the end – he tries to make eye contact with his classmates. When they do not respond he begins to play his instrument again.

At the rehearsal two boys refuse to participate – they come into the room and immediately sit down. Later, they begin to participate, but one of them then tries to leave the classroom. Some pupils drop out and form small groups talking to one another. By the end, three girls and four boys are no longer participating. Today there seems to be less cohesion between the pupils. Most seem to lose interest towards the end and stop singing, although they continue to play the instruments. Many of the children say they want to sit down. The musicians ask them why they are not playing and persuade them to stand up again. Two boys attempt to leave the classroom, and the musicians follow them and encourage them to stay. They tell one boy that there will be a song with drums – drums are something this boy really enjoys. The musicians praise the children, and tell them they are doing a lot better than they had expected.

At the performance, a boy who is normally very keen gets upset and refuses to go on stage, but joins the others for the second song. One of the musicians stays with him, giving him support and reassurance throughout the performance. The boy volunteers to do a solo and is very engaged. All of the children appear to be enjoying themselves. During their solos, they receive applause from the musicians and parents – this seems to give them extra confidence.

4. Corporation Road (two workshops, rehearsal and performance)

At the first workshop observed, the children are excited and enjoy the warm-up session, which involves the musicians asking them a question and then putting the answer into a song that everyone sings. There is a lot of laughter. The pupils have a good rapport with the musicians, and are keen to tell them what they have been doing since they saw them last week. Some of the children are able to recall what they were taught in the previous workshop, and have memorised the song lyrics. One child asks when they will be performing the show – the children seem excited about this. Some of the girls are very shy. They smile, but do not shout out answers or raise their hands during the warm-up session. Towards the end of the session, they seem less inhibited. Two girls are talking, and a boy tells them to “Shut up”. The girls respond badly to this - the situation escalates and the boy begins to shout. Every now and then, this boy sits down and stops playing his instrument.

At the second workshop observed, the children are engaged from the outset and demonstrate high levels of concentration during the full run-through of the first song. One boy continues to play his instrument after being told to stop: a musician takes away his instrument for a couple of minutes. When he is given it back, he begins to engage properly again. The musicians try to encourage the shy girls to do a solo, and support them by joining in. This seems to work, as one shy girl offers to do a solo on her own. However, one shy girl remains virtually immobile. She complies with instructions, but does so mechanically. Some pupils are talking and their classmates tell them to be quiet. The boy who shouted last week spends periods of the session sitting down.

At the rehearsal, the children are very excited. The girls who have volunteered to sing seem very confident and everyone listens carefully to the musicians’

instructions. The children are smiling throughout the performance. The boy who had shouted and sat down during the workshops cries with happiness when his dad hugs him after the show and tells him that he is proud of him. The whole school attends the performance and the children sing along with the songs and applaud loudly. Everyone seems very happy.

2.4 Conversations with parents

The observer chatted with parents after the performances at Northwood and Harrowgate Hill. Parents said their children had been talking about the project at home and singing the songs, and one child was even playing “air” trombone and trumpet. One parent said her daughter was so excited about the project she was talking about it “non-stop”. Some parents said their children were very nervous about the performance before going to school that morning, but seemed fine once they were on stage. One parent said her son seemed anxious about performing, and she thought he was at “that awkward age” where you want to fit in. She said she had reassured her son that everyone on stage would be doing the same thing. She noticed that her son was looking at his peers for confirmation that dancing on stage was okay! Parents said they thought that it was good for their children to feel nervous and get up on stage anyway. One parent said it had built up her son’s confidence. One parent said her daughter had told her that the project would be continuing into secondary school, and the parent was pleased about this as it meant there was some continuity into secondary school, as “transition to school could be difficult”. A couple said that their son loves music, and thought the project was a “good outlet” for him. The parents said they would like their school to run the project again. In the words of one parent, “This is the kind of thing school should be doing.”

3. Discussion

3.1 Hopes/expectations for the In2 project

When asked what challenges their schools and pupils face, teachers mentioned their pupils’ socio-economic status and low self-esteem. In the words of one teacher, ‘...our children have quite tough lives. They have a hard life’ (Corporation Road). This finding is consistent with the report by Darlington Borough Council (OCSI, 2020), which highlights issues around severe and multiple disadvantage (SMD) in the community. One teacher hoped that the project might offer children respite from SMD: ‘It’s also like a little bit of escapism, so if things are tough, you can take yourself somewhere else and make yourself feel good and positive about everything’ (Corporation Road). As might be expected, when asked about their aims for the project, teachers talked about raising pupils’ self-confidence and broadening their horizons: in the words of one teacher, the purpose of the project was ‘to develop the self-confidence and self-esteem of every child’ (Firthmoor).

The interviewer did not ask the musicians contextual questions about deprivation, but they nevertheless identified social justice as one of the project’s

aims. Like the teachers, the musicians hoped that the project would help pupils become more confident and give shy pupils that 'extra little boost' (BCB B), saying this is particularly important in 'low income areas' (BCB A). It is widely acknowledged that children with low socio-economic status are 'at increased risk of reduced health and well-being compared to the general population' (Shannon et al, 2018, p.2), making the teachers' and musicians' desire for the project to enhance pupils' wellbeing highly pertinent.

Consistent with reports on the demise of music education in English schools (see for example Bath et al, 2020; Savage & Barnard, 2019; University of Sussex, 2019; Fautley & Murphy, 2016), the musicians said that music education is being 'taken away from the general curriculum' (BCB A) and quickly becoming something that is only available to people 'with more money' (BCB A). An additional project aim for the musicians, therefore, was to address this gap in provision by giving 'the kids an opportunity to play instruments that they probably wouldn't get' (BCB A). When considered in light of research into the relationship between music participation and wellbeing, the implications of this finding are considerable. According to Weinberg and Joseph (2016, p.2), the social component of music engagement contributes strongly to positive experiences that are bound up with 'self-esteem, optimism and perceived control' (ibid, p.2). If, as the Back Chat Brass musicians imply, these positive experiences are readily available to wealthier pupils, but are increasingly unavailable to disadvantaged pupils, then the decline of music provision in schools risks further compounding health and wellbeing inequalities between pupils (Shannon et al, 2018).

3.2 The In2 music project's perceived value

For the musicians, the value of the project is consistent with its aim: to give disadvantaged pupils the opportunity to play an instrument. By bringing plastic instruments into the schools, Back Chat Brass were able to overcome the tendency of financially-challenged schools to push 'drums or something like that, that they have been doing for years', simply because they have 'a cupboard of some really old instruments' (BCB B). The teachers echoed this sentiment: 'We used to have a professional musician who came in and we had a rock band...and that stopped because we didn't have that funding anymore' (Harrowgate Hill); 'the fact that we've been able to access these resources...it's brilliant, because every school's struggling for budget, aren't they?' (Corporation Road).

In their report on the declining place of music education in schools in England, Bath et al (2020, p.10) identify a 'skills and confidence gap in relation to primary music teaching'. Bath et al (ibid) cite evidence that 'For generalist primary teachers, their training in music on postgraduate courses is extremely limited, ranging between two and eight hours in total'. Primary teachers' resultant inability to teach music proficiently is acknowledged by teachers in our study: "You don't know a lot of primary teachers who are musicians or even musical. Even teachers who lead music in the school don't all play an instrument' (Firthmoor). Our findings indicate that the teachers and musicians believed the in In2 music project was valuable because it

helped overcome some of the issues around music education arising from: its marginalisation in the curriculum; lack of sufficient teacher training, and chronic underfunding (for detailed analysis of these issues, see Bath et al, 2020). The use of a band for the project meant that the musical intervention in schools was 'authentic', and gives pupils the experience of meeting with, and building a relationship with, professional musicians.

This evaluation set out to ask, did the In2 music project result in non-quantifiable changes that are associated with positive outcomes for pupil wellbeing and social capital, such as differences in pupils' levels of 'excitement and engagement' (Brown, 2019, p.16)? In order to answer our research question, we were interested in data that revealed if the project had resulted in non-quantifiable changes associated with positive outcomes for pupil wellbeing and social capital. Although bound-up with the project's attempt to address the social justice implications of the marginalisation and underfunding of music education, we were seeking evidence of the value of the project beyond the issue of equity of provision. With regard to social capital, the responses of the teachers were insightful. One said, 'I think [the pupils] felt successful, because a lot of them don't feel like they are successful in a lot of things in school, but [the project] was a chance for them to be successful. And they felt it' (Firthmoor). The use of the word "successful" is interesting, as in educational settings, "success" is strongly associated with academic performance rather than the benefits to the self and society of positive interpersonal relationships. In 2015, the UK Government (DfE, 2015, p.3) produced a report, claiming that 'Successful schools have a clear vision for what all their pupils will achieve through high quality teaching, with an ethos that reinforces aspiration and attainment for all'. Presumably, schools with low pupil attainment are not "successful". In terms of social justice, the conflation of success with attainment is problematic, as the UK Government (DfE, 2019) has itself acknowledged the link between deprivation and academic under-performance. In its report on Key Stage 4 performance (DfE, 2019, p.8) the Government states, 'Attainment was lower for disadvantaged pupils compared to all other pupils across all headline measures in 2019 consistent with previous years.' As noted by Henry Giroux (2015), the politics of austerity are creating both the conditions of hardship and providing a "rationale" to disparage those thereby dispossessed and rendered "unsuccessful". Arguably, the teacher's use of the highly loaded word "success" to describe the pupils' experience of the In2 music project is an example of what Gerald Roche (2019) describes as the decolonisation of language. According to Roche (2019), we decolonise language when we use it to demand recognition of marginalised groups within society, rather than reinforce their subjugation. By describing disadvantaged pupils as "successful" outside the standard discourse of academic attainment, the teacher draws attention to the value of the project as a means to foster social capital within a wider culture that works against this process.

To understand how the wider culture might block the development of disadvantaged pupils' social capital, it is perhaps helpful to consider Ruth Wright's (2012, p. 12) assertion that there is 'a symbiotic relationship between inclusion and

social capital – one cannot be without the other.’ This claim resonates with Diener, Oishi, and Lucas’ (2003) analysis of subjective wellbeing:

Marginal individuals...might have a harder time in individualistic [Western] societies than in collectivist ones, whereas people with a large number of strengths and resources might enjoy the individualistic lifestyle more. (Diener, Oishi & Lucas, 2003, p.412)

In order to have social capital, children need to feel “included”, rather than on the margins of society, and this sense of inclusion is, in turn, part of social capital. For disadvantaged children, inclusion can be challenging. As noted by Tess Ridge (2013), austerity measures have disproportionately affected poorer children in England, entrenching SMD and ensuring they are unable to access extracurricular activities such as music lessons. In addition, poorer children are less likely to feel included in mainstream education. Data published in 2019 reveal that, in England, ‘78% of permanent exclusions were to pupils who either had SEN, were classified as in need or were eligible for free school meals’, while ‘11% of permanent exclusions were issued to pupils who had all three characteristics’ (Timpson Review of School Exclusion, 2019, p.10). In 2019, there was a sharp rise in the number of school exclusions in the North East of England, with 929 pupils excluded in Darlington (Conner-Hill, 2019). It seems, then, that schools are struggling to overcome barriers to poorer pupils’ “sense of belonging” in education, which in turn block the development of social capital.

Although the picture looks bleak, Wright (2012) argues that music education offers a ray of hope:

Music might be one of the answers to building social capital; a way of reaching outside individual identities and co-constructing new shared ones: a new sensation of ‘we’. (Wright, 2012, p.12)

Music’s ability to foster ‘a new sensation of “we”’ was evident in the teachers and musicians’ discussion of the project: the pupils had ‘opened up’ (Corporation Road) and were ‘all coming together to do something together’ (BCB B). The involvement of the pupils’ parents helped strengthen this sense of “we” by bringing the school and families together. One teacher asked the interviewer, ‘Did you see the parents at the back? They were so excited about it and they were beaming... the parents feel proud and, in return, the children feel proud because they’re making the parents smile. And it’s just that big cycle, isn’t it?’ (Corporation Road). The importance of the involvement of parents and the wider community was mentioned by another teacher, who said, ‘we’ve kept [the In2 music project] high profile and around like outside of school as well as in the classroom, just so that everybody’s there, everybody’s involved in what the children are doing’ (Firthmoor). According to Wright, (2012, p. 13) people who make music together ‘mould their own minds and bodies into a shared emotional state’ that is communicable to others. This process of integration helps develop social capital, even in the most challenging circumstances (Wright, 2012).

3.3 Behavioural changes

In their analysis of the social and cultural benefits of live music, Arno van der Hoeven and Erik Hitters (2019, p.263) found that live music 'offers a sense of belonging'. Similarly, in their case study of the manifestation of social capital in a community choir, Thomas Langston and Margaret Barrett (2008, p.119) claim that group-based singing fosters 'fellowship'. For Langston and Barrett (2008, p.131), 'fellowship evolves from and, in turn, facilitates trust, friendship, mutual support, working together and the development of relationships', and is therefore an important 'social capital indicator' (ibid). Indeed, for some choir members, 'fellowship is as important as music' (ibid). The interview and observation data from the In2 music project appear to confirm Langston and Barrett's (2008) claim that group-based music develops fellowship. The observer records examples of pupils showing one another how to play the correct note; applauding the efforts of soloists; encouraging their classmates to behave appropriately, and copying dance moves. One musician described how, over time, the pupils began to see themselves as a musical ensemble preparing to put on a show: 'You can see them take ownership of it and the maybe slightly disinterested ones suddenly starting to nudge the one next to them that keeps trying to distract them and try to get them involved again' (BCB B). One parent described the support her son received from his classmates, saying he gained confidence about dancing on stage by making eye contact with his fellow dancers. For some pupils, the fellowship fostered by the In2 music project began to permeate and enhance their everyday classroom behaviour: 'Within class, children that wouldn't share their ideas before...feel like that they're more, "I'll give it a go"' (Corporation Road); 'They've been more responsive and more positive in their behaviour' (Firthmoor).

Music teachers Randall Everett Allsup and Eric Shieh (2012, p.48) encourage music educators to orient themselves to the 'diverse and particular ways that students reveal who they are through the work we do together in this public space called school', arguing that 'the moral imperative to care' is 'at the heart of teaching' (ibid). Orientation and the moral imperative to care are evident in the In2 music project. Rather than seeking information in advance about disruptive pupils, the musicians preferred to let the pupils reveal who they were through their engagement with music: 'Sometimes you will get told the stuff [about pupils with behavioural issues]. When we first go to a group, I like to not know anything, because you start treating them different' (BCB A). The musicians capitalised on the pleasure of fellowship (Langston and Barrett, 2008) by praising disruptive or non-compliant children's integration with the group, however fleeting: 'I've found the best way to deal with [a disruptive pupil] is when you see, as soon as they get involved at any point, you kind of draw attention to them' (BCB A). A musician recalled one disruptive boy whom he complimented in this manner: '...you could tell the change and you know he's trying to hide his smile' (BCB A).

The musicians' patience and compassion is evident in the observer's records. Throughout the workshops, pupils displayed challenging behaviour. This involved

dropping out of the circle and refusing to participate, aggravating other pupils and not listening to instructions from the musicians. The musicians used positive feedback and spent time one-on-one with distressed or shy pupils to entice them to participate. Rather than displaying impatience over pupils' dis-engagement, the musicians remained sensitive to unknown pressures influencing pupil behaviour: '...two girls at school yesterday, the week before. They were both not in a great place' (BCB A). 'They refused to play...She left the room a couple times as well. But then this week, she's happy' (BCB B). Teachers praised the musicians' approach: 'It's been really lovely and Back Chat Brass - their manner with the children and everything - is just perfect. You know, they've got the boundary but they've got the fun element as well, in the fact that it's okay to be a little bit silly. But yeah, really lovely role models for the children' (Corporation Road). Perhaps because of the fellowship fostered through group music making, it seems that the "moral imperative to care" extended to the pupils in the In2 music project: the observer records that pupils supported the musicians by gently admonishing "naughty" classmates and encouraging shy or reluctant pupils to join in through eye contact, smiles and applause.

4. Conclusion

This evaluation set out to ask, "Did the In2 music project result in non-quantifiable changes that are associated with positive outcomes for pupil wellbeing and social capital, such as differences in pupils' levels of 'excitement and engagement' (Brown, 2019, p.16)?" The evaluation used the Dialogic Measure of Impact to (i) assess the success of the pedagogic innovation in terms of social capital and pupil wellbeing and (ii) use this assessment as a means to improve future performance (Brown, 2019). The evaluation also employed observations to help understand the lived experience of the project, and held informal conversations with parents to discover their beliefs about the value of the project. Analysis of the resultant interview and observation data indicates that the answer to the research question is affirmative: the In2 project *has* made a positive contribution to the development of disadvantaged pupils' social capital and wellbeing.

The Durham Commission on Creativity and Education (Durham University & ACE, 2019, p. 8) reports that 'Young people can find strength, inspiration, consolation and community in their shared experience of creativity', and notes that 'connections between personal fulfilment, wellbeing and creativity are well documented (ibid, p.39). As an example of creative engagement, it is therefore not surprising that the In2 music project has enhanced pupils' wellbeing, defined simply as 'quality of life' (Diener, Oishi, & Lucas, 2003, p.405). Parents told us about their children's enthusiasm for the project, whether it be singing the songs at home, playing "air" trumpets and trombones, or talking about Back Chat Brass "non-stop". Teachers shared with us their delight in seeing pupils grow in confidence: '...they've opened up and I think they've become more positive and they've got more self-belief and confidence in themselves. Yeah, it was lovely' (Corporation Road). It is clear that the In2 music project brought something special into the children's lives. In February

2020, one musician said, 'Hopefully they'll come away thinking, "Actually, music is great and I want to do more of that, playing together"' (BCB B). In May 2020, this hope turned into reality when a primary head teacher told us that one of their Looked After Children, a 'shy, retiring young lady' who took part in the In2 music project, has asked if she can learn to play the trombone, and that her foster parents are planning to support her with music tuition. We anticipate that participants who consider taking up an instrument later in their childhood will feel fewer barriers in doing so, and will experience the lifelong benefits of playing a musical instrument.

Social capital refers to the benefits that individuals and communities derive from positive interpersonal relationships (Dewey, 2009). High levels of social capital are associated with 'lower crime rates, better health, higher educational achievement and improved economic development' (Wright, 2012, p.12), making social capital highly desirable. As noted by Robert Putman (1995, p.66), 'For a variety of reasons, life is easier in a community blessed with a substantial stock of social capital'. Our study confirms Patrick Jones' (2008, p.130) theory that music education 'can uniquely foster the development of social capital', because playing instruments or singing in a group requires cooperation and coordination of focus over time. As Anita Prest (2016, p.151) puts it, 'Music making, similar to relationships, occurs through time and is the result of concerted effort'. The data indicate that pupils in the In2 project developed relationships over time, both with Back Chat Brass and with one another, and it is clear that these relationships sustained pupils' engagement with the project and helped develop their self-confidence.

According to Langston and Barrett (2008, p.131), fellowship is based on feelings of 'trust, camaraderie, togetherness, friendship, warmth, support and deep appreciation of the feelings and needs of members within a group', and examples of all of these attributes were found in the interview transcripts and observation records. While the indicators of social capital are 'many and diverse' (Langston & Barrett, 2008, p.123), fellowship - defined simply as caring *for* others and being cared for *by* others – is foundational to the positive interpersonal relationships that are at the heart of social capital. The observation record contains an illustrative example of how the In2 music project fostered a sense of fellowship:

A Year 6 boy struggles to regulate his behaviour, shouting out answers and upsetting classmates by telling them to be quiet. He alternates between enthusiasm and non-compliance, often sitting down and refusing to play. Back Chat Brass interact with the boy calmly and kindly, and he continuously drops-out and re-joins the circle of pupils. Despite these difficulties, the boy takes part in the performance in front of his schoolmates, teachers and the parents. After the show, the boy cries tears of happiness when his father hugs him and says he is "proud" of him. (Observer)

Warmth, support and togetherness – attributes that are fundamental to fellowship - appear to define this boy's experience of the In2 music project.

A report commissioned recently by the Musicians' Union claims that 'Music education in the United Kingdom is in a perilous state' (Savage & Barnard, 2019, p.3). Participants in our evaluation of the In2 music project confirm the report's findings that schools lack funding to purchase musical instruments and teachers have insufficient expertise to teach music. As noted by Wright (2012, p.12), unsatisfactory provision of music in schools means that 'music education favours middle class children from families who can afford for their children to have

additional tuition outside the school'. The social justice implications of this are twofold. Firstly, it is obviously unfair for parental income to be the determining factor in who gets to play a musical instrument and who does not. Secondly, research indicates that affluent people have higher levels of social capital than poorer people do (Pichler & Wallace, 2008), and that group-based music enhances social capital and wellbeing (Jones, 2008; Langston & Barrett, 2008; Wright, 2012; Prest, 2016; Weinberg & Joseph, 2016). This suggests that wealthier pupils with relatively high levels of social capital are having their social capital and wellbeing further enhanced through music education, while poorer pupils with relatively low levels of social capital and wellbeing are not.

Ridge (2013) and Giroux (2015) argue that austerity politics are pushing less affluent individuals further to the margins of society. Research indicates that marginalised people struggle to feel the sense of “belonging” that is fundamental to social capital (Diener, Oishi, & Lucas, 2003), making social capital less accessible to deprived pupils. In our education system, this sense of “not belonging” often translates into school exclusion (Timpson Review of School Exclusion, 2019). Many of the children who took part in the In2 music project are experiencing severe and multiple disadvantage (SMD) (Community Foundation, 2017; see also OCSI, 2020). A report commissioned recently by the UK Government acknowledges that the risk factors for school exclusion include ‘parental ill health and disability, unemployment, poverty and poor housing’ (Graham et al, 2019, p.24); phenomena reported as prevalent in the catchment areas of the schools in the In2 music project (OSCI, 2020). The social justice implications of SMD are not restricted to school exclusion, as UK Government data reveal that pupils with SMD consistently fail to reach the same levels of attainment as more privileged children (DfE, 2019).

The In2 music project enabled pupils experiencing SMD to enjoy the benefits of fellowship through group-based music, and to begin to develop the sense of “belonging” upon which social capital is built. It is little wonder, then, that teachers expressed the hope that more children might be able to take part in the project (see section 5. Recommendations).

5. Recommendations

Teachers were enthusiastic about the In2 music project because they saw how much their pupils enjoyed it: in the words of one teacher, the pupils were ‘buzzing’ (Corporation Road). They also supported the project because they saw how much it enhanced their pupils’ self-confidence: in the words of one teacher, ‘they are starting to get braver’ (Harrowgate Hill). All of the teachers said they would like the project to be available to more pupils, with one saying ‘I’d love to do it with the whole, you know, with all the children. How amazing would that be?’ (Harrowgate Hill). Our first recommendation is therefore:

Scale-up the project to enable more pupils to participate

It was clear from the observations and interviews that Back Chat Brass has developed a distinct teaching method that works extremely well. Key to the project's success as a means to foster fellowship is the musicians' immersion in the pupils' performance. In the words of one musician:

The way we will often work is we will play alongside, whether children or adults, because we want it to sound good...One of the things I notice is kids who seem a bit disinterested, they suddenly realise "This does actually sound quite good", and I think that's why it's important. If we were just trying to make it so that [Back Chat Brass] are not involved – I've personally found that doesn't work as well as saying, "You're going to join us – you're going to join the professionals and we're going to do a performance together." (BCB A)

Teachers recognised the value of having professional musicians working alongside their pupils. In the words of one teacher: 'Working with the Back Chat Brass band was just phenomenal...Not many children get a chance to actually work with people like that. I think the opportunity that has come for our children has just been phenomenal' (Firthmoor). Our second recommendation is therefore:

Continue to work with Back Chat Brass

The musicians explained how they had developed their method for plastic instrument workshops. When asked what they would do differently in the future, the musicians said that they would 'prefer sessions that kind of get onto the fun stuff quicker. I think sometimes, we will spend too much time on the technical stuff' (BCB A). When asked what they had learned from this project, one musician said, 'I guess I have learned to expect pupils can do way more ...I think we've pushed it a bit more this time in terms of harmony. We've never done that. Yeah...they do retain a lot of information' (BCB A). Our third recommendation is therefore:

Invite Back Chat Brass to develop workshops that build on the insights gained through the In2 music project

6. Video of project

A video of the project has been made by Andy Berriman. Please see:

<https://vimeo.com/398663738/876ffc69f3>

7. References

- ACE (2006) *Providing the Best: Guidance for artists and arts organisations on assessing the quality of activities provided for children and young people*. London: Arts Council England.
- Allsup, R.E. & Shieh, E. (2012) 'Social Justice and Music Education: The Call for a Public Pedagogy' *Music Educators Journal*, 98 (4), pp. 47-51.
- Bailey, S. (2010) *Who are the most vulnerable pupils at transition? The impact of risk and resiliency factors in the experiences and adjustment of children*

after the move from primary to secondary school. London: University of London, Institute of Education D.Ed.Psy Dissertation.

- Bath N, Daubney A, Mackrill D, Spruce G. (2020) 'The declining place of music education in schools in England' *Child Soc.* pp. 1–15.
<https://doi.org/10.1111/chso.12386>
- BERA (2018) *Ethical Guidelines for Educational Research, Fourth Edition*. Available online at: <https://www.bera.ac.uk/publication/ethical-guidelines-for-educational-research-2018> [Accessed 1 November 2019].
- Bourdieu, P. (1986) 'The Forms of Capital' In: Richardson, J.G. (ed.) *Handbook of Theory and Research for the Sociology of Education*. New York: Greenwood Press, pp. 241–258.
- Brown, C. (2019) 'Using theories of action approach to measure impact in an intelligent way: A case study from Ontario Canada' *Journal of Educational Change* <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10833-019-09353-3>
- Carter, N., Bryant-Lukosius, D2., DiCenso, A, Blythe, J., & Neville, A.J. (2014) 'The use of triangulation in qualitative research' *Oncol Nurs Forum*, 41 (5), pp.545-7.
- Cohen, L., Manion, L. & Morrison, K. (2018) *Research Methods in Education, Eighth Edition*. Abingdon: Routledge.
- Community Foundation (2017) *Tees Valley's Vital Issues 2017*. Available online at: <https://www.communityfoundation.org.uk/wordpress/wp-content/uploads/2017/10/Vital-Issues-Tees-Valley-including-Darlington-2017-FINAL.pdf> [Accessed 29 January 2020].
- Conner-Hill, R. (2019) 'Sharp rise in school exclusions rates in North-East – with one suspending more than half of pupils' *The Northern Echo*, 03/09/19. Available online at: <https://www.thenorthernecho.co.uk/news/17876334.sharp-rise-school-exclusions-rate-north-east---one-suspending-half-pupils/> [Accessed 5 May 2020].
- Dewey, J. (1909) 'Address by Prof John Dewey' In: Proceedings of the National Negro Conference, New York, May 31 and June 1, pp.71-73. Available online at: <http://moses.law.umn.edu/darrow/documents/Proceedings%20of%20the%20National%20Negro%20Conference%201909%20New%20York%20May%20031%20and%20June%201.pdf> [Accessed 19 February 2020]
- DfE (2015) *Supporting the Attainment of Disadvantaged Pupils. Briefing for School Leaders*. Available online at: https://assets.publishing.service.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment_data/file/473976/DFE-RS411_Supporting_the_attainment_of_disadvantaged_pupils_-_briefing_for_school_leaders.pdf [Accessed 4 May 2020].
- DfE (2019) *Key Stage 4 Performance, 2019*. Available online at: <https://assets.publishing.service.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/>

[attachment_data/file/863815/2019_KS4_revised_text.pdf](#) [Accessed 5 May 2020].

- Diener, E., Oishi, S. & Lucas, R.E. (2003) 'Personality, Culture, and Subjective Well-being: Emotional and Cognitive Evaluations of Life' *Annual Review of Psychology*, (54), pp. 404-425.
- Durham University & ACE (2019) *Durham Commission on Creativity and Education*. Durham: Durham University. University and Arts Council England.
- EEF (2020) 'Stirling Children's Well-being Scale' Available online at: <https://educationendowmentfoundation.org.uk/projects-and-evaluation/evaluating-projects/measuring-essential-skills/spectrum-database/stirling-childrens-well-being-scale/> [Accessed 30 January 2020].
- Evangelou, M., Taggart, B., Sylva, K., Melhuish, E., Sammons, P., & Siraj-Blatchford, I. (2008) *What makes a successful transition from primary to secondary school*. Nottingham: Department for Children Schools and Families.
- Fautley, M. & Murphy, R. (2016) 'Music education in a time of austerity' *British Journal of Music Education*, 33 (1), pp.1-3.
- Fredricks, J.A., Reschly, A.L. & Christenson, S.L. (2019) *Handbook of Student Engagement Interventions*. London: Elsevier.
- Gewirtz, S., Dickson, M., Power, S., Halpin, D. & Whitty, G. (2005) 'The deployment of social capital theory in educational policy and provision: the case of Education Action Zones in England' *British Educational Research Journal*, 31 (6), pp. 651-673.
- Giroux, H. (2015) 'Austerity Politics' *Throughout*. Available online at: <https://truthout.org/articles/the-shadow-of-fascism-and-the-poison-of-neoliberal-austerity-policies/> [Accessed 6 May 2020].
- Graham, B., White, C., Edwards, A., Potter, S. & Street, C. (2019) *School exclusion: a literature review on the continued disproportionate exclusion of certain children*. London: Department for Education. Available online at: https://assets.publishing.service.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment_data/file/800028/Timpson_review_of_school_exclusion_literature_review.pdf [Accessed 6 May 2020].
- Hoeven, van der, A. & Hitters, E. (2019) 'The social and cultural values of live music: Sustaining urban live music ecologies' *Cities*, 90, pp. 263-271.
- HM Treasury (2010) *Spending Review 2010*. Available online at: https://assets.publishing.service.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment_data/file/203826/Spending_review_2010.pdf [Accessed 28 January 2020].
- Jones, P. M. (2008) 'Developing Social Capital: A Role for Music Education and Community Music in Fostering Civic Engagement and Intercultural Understanding' *CMA XI: Projects, Perspectives, and Conversations: Proceedings from the International Society for Music Education (ISME) 2008*

Seminar of the Commission for Community Music Activity, 16-18 July 2008.
Rome: Accademia Nazionale di Santa Cecilia - Auditorium Parco della
Musica. pp. 130 – 144.

- Langston, T.W. & Barrett, M.S. (2008) 'Capitalizing on community music: a case study of the manifestation of social capital in a community choir' *Research Studies in Music Education*, 30 (2), pp. 118–138.
- McGee, C., Ward, R., Gibbons, J. & Harlow, A. (2004) *Transition to secondary school: a literature review*. Hamilton: The University of Waikato.
- Miles, M.B. & Huberman, A.M. (1984) *Qualitative Data Analysis*. Beverly Hills, CA: Sage.
- OCSI (2020) *Local Insight profile for 'Darlington' area*. Available online at: <https://darlington.communityinsight.org/#> [Accessed 2 March 2020].
- Pichler, F. & Wallace, C. (2009) 'Social Capital and Social Class in Europe: The Role of Social Networks in Social Stratification' *European Sociological Review*, 25 (3), pp. 319–332.
- Prest, A. (2016) 'Social Capital as a Framework in Music Education Research' *Action, Criticism & Theory for Music Education*, 15 (4), pp.127-160.
- Putman, R.D. (1995) 'Bowling Alone: America's Declining Social Capital' *Journal of Democracy*, 6 (1), pp. 65-78.
- Rees, G. & Bradshaw, J. (2018) 'Exploring low subjective well-being among children aged 11 in the UK: an analysis using data reported by parents and by children' *Child Indicators Research*, 11 (1), pp.27-56.
- Ridge, T. (2013) "We are All in This Together"? The Hidden Costs of Poverty, Recession and Austerity Policies on Britain's Poorest Children' *Children & Society*, 27 (5), pp. 406-417.
- Roche, G. (2019) 'Linguistic Injustice, Decolonization, and Language Endangerment' *Easy Chair Reprint*, No. 1726.
- Savage, J. & Barnard, D. (2019) 'The State of Play: A Review of Music Education in England 2019' Available online at: <https://www.musiciansunion.org.uk/StateOfPlay> [Accessed 7 January 2020].
- Shannon, S., Brennan, D., Hanna, D., Younger, Z., Hassan, J. & Breslin, G. (2018) 'The Effect of a School-Based Intervention on Physical Activity and Well-Being: a Non-Randomised Controlled Trial with Children of Low Socio-Economic Status' *Sports Medicine – Open*, 4 (16), pp. 1-12.
- Stop School Cuts (2019) 'Impact in Darlington' Available online at: <https://schoolcuts.org.uk/schools/?chosenSchool=8413517> [Accessed 28 January 2020].
- Tam, K.-P., Lau, H.P & Jiang, D. (2012) 'Culture and Subjective Well-Being: A Dynamic Constructivist View' *Journal of Cross-Cultural Psychology*, 43 (1) pp.23-31.
- TES (2020) 'DfE to publish new model music curriculum' Available online at: <https://www.tes.com/news/dfе-publish-new-model-music-curriculum> [Accessed 28 January 2020].

- Timpson Review of School Exclusion. CP92 (2019) Available online at: https://assets.publishing.service.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment_data/file/807862/Timpson_review.pdf [Accessed 4 May 2020].
- University of Sussex (2019) All-Party Parliamentary Group for Music Education, the Incorporated Society of Musicians and the University of Sussex: *Music Education: State of the Nation*. Available online at: <https://www.ism.org/images/images/State-of-the-Nation-Music-Education-WEB.pdf> [Accessed 27 January 2020].
- Weinberg, M.K & Joseph, D. (2016) 'If you're happy and you know it: Music engagement and subjective wellbeing' *Psychology of Music*, pp.1-16. DOI: 10.1177/0305735616659552
- Wright, R. (2012) 'Music Education and Social Transformation: Building Social Capital through Music' *The Canadian Music Educator*, 55 (3), pp.12-13.

8. Appendices

Appendix A: Interview questions

School lead/head teacher

1. How would you describe the challenges faced by your school and your pupils?
2. What were your hopes for this project? (And later on, have these been met?)
3. What have your pupils gained through this project?
4. What have teachers and the school more broadly gained from the project?
5. Have you observed any changes in pupil behaviour? If so, what are these changes?
6. What has been the impact of these changes?
7. Please describe what you believe to be the value of this project.
8. As school lead/head teacher, how did you support this project? Please describe what you did.
9. What have you learned as a result of this project?
10. If you were to do this again, would you do anything differently?
11. What are your recommendations for future projects?

Musicians

1. What were your aims for this project?
2. How did you develop your ideas for this project?
3. What were the project activities?
4. What changes, if any, were you hoping to bring about?

5. What have pupils gained through this project? What impact has been reported to you by the school?
6. What impact have you seen first-hand?
7. What changes in pupil behaviour have you observed?
8. How well supported did you feel by the school lead/head teacher?
9. What have you learned as a result of this project?
10. If you were to do this again, would you do anything differently?
11. What are your recommendations for future projects?

Appendix B: Observation schedule

Date:

School:

Start time:

Finish time:

Unit of observation (e.g. small group of pupils; all pupils; musicians and pupils, etc.)

Please note when you move between units of observation.